GENDER STEREOTYPE, GLASS CEILING AND WOMEN’S CAREER ADVANCEMENT: AN EMPIRICAL STUDY IN SERVICE SECTOR OF PAKISTAN

Hira Shabbir
Department of Business Administration, Government College University, Faisalabad, Pakistan
hira_haadiyah@outlook.com

Muhammad Ashar Shakeel
Department of Business Administration, Government College University, Faisalabad, Pakistan
ashar.shakeel@gmail.com

Rana Ahsan Zubair
Department of Public Administration, Government College University, Faisalabad, Pakistan
ahsan_zubair@hotmail.com

Abstract

Glass ceiling is considered to be as a hot issue in practical life regarding females. Many studies are done over this issue in different dimensions like harassment, female in management, gender inequality, pay discrimination, career barriers for women etc. The current study aims at finding career barriers which create hurdles in women progress specifically considering the females of Pakistan. The survey of questionnaire is adopted for study, based on three variables; gender stereotype, glass ceiling and women career advancement. The scale is WAMS instrument; WAMS stands for Turkish version of the (WAMS) Women as Managers Scale (Peters, 1974). The other scale of this study is Glass Ceiling, developed by SANEF (South African National Editors Forum) survey report in 2007. The scale was modified according to the needs of the research. The nature of research is quantitative, based on questionnaire survey. The sample size of the study is 272; data was gathered through different cities like Faisalabad, Lahore and Islamabad by concerning the areas of Telecommunication and Banking. The questionnaire is distributed herself by researcher and posted to people to get responses. The gathered data is interpreted by using statistical tool specifically regression, correlation and mediation. The software Preacher and Hayes for Mediation is used for data analysis and interpretation. The results revealed that gender stereotype has positive impact on glass ceiling; on the other hand gender stereotype has negative impact on women’s career advancement. Glass ceiling mediate between gender stereotype and women career advancement has confirmed by previous and current study. This study has many practical implications in the field the organizations can make policies to tackle problems like harassment and gender inequality. The whole scenario can be settled down by creating opportunities and making justice in all respective ways.

Keywords: Gender Stereotype, Service Sector, Glass Ceiling, Barriers, Women Career Advancement.

1. Introduction

The concept of women's career advancement serves a vital presence in the field of management. It has some limitations and issues. Career advancement is probably the most significant component for employee satisfaction and retention for a company. According to Bal et al. (2013) career advancement means “achieving a top position for a particular company through a series of stages, in other words it could mean attaining experience in several professional
It consists of an entrepreneur’s dreams of success. Like an author’s desires for publications and a developer’s prefer to acquire complex capabilities even in the job. The different studies on women’s career advancement prominent the significance of individual and situational factors. Three issues are included in individual factors: women’s attitudes towards career advancement, work related demographics and early socialization. Displayed attitudes by women who get fast in their career included high self-efficacy a strong desire to succeed, outstanding career (as opposed to family) identities, internal attribution to success, and positive attitudes towards mobility and relocation (Greenhaus, 1993; Lobel & Clair, 1992; Morrison, 1982; Ragins & Sundstrom, 1989).

According to Pickersgill et al. (1996) to accomplish equal status, the requirement of women to attain in the work environment is scheduled at a higher standard that is necessary to work harder, be more ambitious, more competent and skilled than their male counterparts. However, they do not usually attain well-respected positions with the same relief as their male counterparts with similar positions, backgrounds and educations as themselves. “Glass Ceiling” is a barrier to career advancement is an unofficial but an actual obstacle to women’s advancement into upper level management roles is due to dissemination based on individuals’ gender, age, race, ethnicity and sexual preference (Microsoft Encarta World Encyclopedia).

Now, women’s related issues have turned into a main part of the concern. Sessions, workshops are being organized in all over the world to discuss women’s career related issues in all professional fields. Because of the most important features of the worldwide labor market in the last half of the twentieth decade that is enhancing the contribution of women (Black, 1999; Caligiuri et al., 1999).

Different studies demonstrate that through the last two centuries there has been an escalation for women at entry and middle-level administration positions, earlier to twentieth century, there was no study on the workers’ problems. Ann Morrison introduced the term glass ceiling in 1980s. Glass Ceiling, is a common trend, hidden curtain that hides the natural talent of the women and retain all of them far from the top management of an organization (Maxwell, 2007). Women have to face artificial barriers when they trying to climb to the advance level. The metaphor used to incriminate this condition is called ‘glass ceiling’. Consequent metaphors such as “glass elevators” along with “glass cliffs” denote to the superior analysis as well as criticism that women possibly will have to face in management roles (Ryan & Haslam, 2005).

Many researchers perceive that organizations have remained male-dominated due to increase in the number of women employees within organizations from the last few decades (Ballenger, 2010; Bimrose et al., 2014; O’Neil et al., 2008). The US department of labour acknowledged that nowadays many of the women favors the managerial careers and their employee contribution have been encouragingly enhanced though this growth rate. This department printed a report, the gap between proportion of male and female managers was contracted, for instance, in 1940 only 4% female employees inhabited in management situations whereas there were 9.6 % male employees occupying the management jobs. 11.1 percent females with the dramatic increase of 7 percent was opposing with 13.8 percent male managers in 1990.

The focused problem in this research is gender differences in female profession and highlight glass ceiling issues that prevent the women to the top-level management. This study is based on female employees, working in service sector of Pakistan. In the era of competition, women move in the every field of profession, have knowledge, abilities and competencies to do work but do not nominated at the executive and managerial levels in masculine organizational culture. For this issue present study was designed by keeping in view these factors. The objectives of the current study is enlisted below:

1. To study the relationship among gender stereotype, glass ceiling and women’s career advancement.
2. To examine the impact of gender stereotype on glass ceiling and women’s career advancement.
3. To investigate whether glass ceiling mediates the relationship among gender stereotype and women’s career advancement.

2. Literature Review
Earlier in the twentieth century, there was no study on the workers’ problems. Ann Morrison introduced the term glass ceiling in 1980s. The word ‘ceiling’ involve that there is a limitation, preventing career growth and “glass’ transparent and unseen” (Pillai et al.). According to (Maxwell, 2007) glass ceiling, a common trend is the hidden curtain that hides the natural talent of the women and retain all of them far from the top management of an organization. “Glass Ceiling” a barricade to future career, is an unsanctioned but actual obstacle to women’s advancement in to higher (managerial) ranks due to dissemination based on individuals’ gender, age, race, ethnicity and sexual preference (Microsoft Encarta World Encyclopedia). Glass ceiling is an obstacle to women’s career in a way that women have to face biasedness based on age, race, customs and gender preferences. (Microsoft Encarta World Encyclopedia).

Social cognitive theory explains that people play roles, which the society sets for their gender. (Ajzen & Fishbein, 1977; Ashmore & Del Boca, 2013; Bem, 1981; Fiske, 2005). Persons with gender stereotyping mindset hire employees based on this criteria and keep on following the same for their evaluation too. In this way show comparatively high rates of stereotyping than those who’s hiring is independent of genders (Dobbins et al., 1988). These “gender-typed” personalities will create favoritism in their ratings in provision of their gender-role stereotypes that definitely create the barriers to move up to the higher level (DeNisi et al., 1984). Wilson et al. (2000) argue about this declaring that individuals who embrace a traditional gender philosophy keep a pronatalist perspective (women are stimulated to involve in childbearing, but are dispirited from catching substitute roles, such as finding employment) and would be more likely to designate females using gender-based stereotypes. Consequently, negative implications, containing discrimination, may result when people use gender-role stereotypes to assess and organize information in an assessment setting. Contrariwise, since an individual who holds a traditional gender philosophy may determine a pro-male favoritism in his/her assessments, absolutely influenced ratings are also a conceivable importance. While plentiful, discussions regarding the protection of gender stereotyping yielded different proposals. These proposals set the grounds of criteria for performance judgment due to the lack of research in this field (Dobbins et al., 1988). However, the recent study observed the effect of gender-role stereotypes on women professional career.

2.1. Gender-Role Stereotypes

Gender stereotyping is a procedure of judging male and females on the base of their culturally recommended roles and then assigning them in different classifications, limits the prospective of both males and females (Agars, 2004). According to Schein (1973) gender stereotyping has been determined as “the belief that a set of qualities and capabilities is more probable to be existent among one gender than the other.”

This is well defined by means of the attribution theory that has been established by Kelley (1967). In accordance to this theory, the participants of an in-group chalk up with particular qualities and characteristics to a convinced group who is appropriate to an out-group. There are bundle of details for being stereotypes. These explanations are well described by a Cambridge professor Brown in 1995 in his article. He clarified these in a hierachial order of prominence as “religion, nationality, race, gender and prerequisite” (Brown, 1995). In a male prejudice society, a male manager symbolizes the role of a traditional and stereotype male in an organization. It is also stereotypical and behavioral acceptance that a female cannot be fruitful manager (Tajfel, 1982). They were not deliberated an applicable fit for such professional and executive post.

A gender stereotype simply means role fixation associated with different genders. It is actually an outline, which particulates different individuals because of their sexual characteristics sourced from conventional philosophies. These characteristics are related to physic, position and employment. Position characteristics pertain to the nature i.e. males are mood wise violent. Physical characteristics are associated with weight etc. Traditionally women are considered physically weak due to their skinny and slim body structure. Employment characteristics means that males join particular fields which are specified for them such as carpenters ; (Helgeson, 2002). Gender stereotype also includes vivid features. It clarifies actual differences among genders through explaining their duties and limitations (Burgess & Borgida, 1999; Eagly, 1987; Terborg, 1977). The researcher verified the existence of gender stereotyping through which females were considered as less efficient, non-serious about goals as compared to males (Broverman et al., 1972).
In the Asian perspective in India and Pakistan, women sensation that although possibilities for work are actually now progressively open for them, they have to combat against gender bias in order to obtain approval as the same at the work front. A small number of women have sophisticated as rapid the organizational structure as their colleagues. Researcher identified that women managers, which have currently moved from of their traditional roles by becoming managers, are rebellious such as stubborn when they reject to adapt to the image of the traditional role (Singh, 2003). Two apparent detectible procedures control that women feel contented in their roles as wives or mothers, as they understand that their career desires are dissenting with their role (Singh, 2003).

2.2. Glass Ceiling

Glass ceiling has been studied in different fields, Psychology, sociology, economics and management. About glass ceiling (Browne, (1998)) used to say that women are commonly not likely to be able for authority, keeps which the appropriate labeling it as “gossamer ceiling” as the organizations have biasedness against females only and that they are not willing to change. Instead (Barreto et al., 2009) and (Burke & Vinnicombe, 2005) also described about glass ceiling that the barriers that preventing the women to get the top positions in their careers.

One more hurdle, researcher discussed that women has been prohibit from information and social network that provide the more chances of opportunities in their career. Researchers pointed out another barrier that create hurdle in women success at workplace is glass cliff. They predicate that women tend to be promoted to unsafe authority positions. This only happens when females move to management positions (Ryan & Haslam, 2005). The researchers based their experimental research on the views of management students and successful businesspersons. The findings were again confirming females’ exploitation. The research declared that an organization would be willing to promote women when all the men proved to be helpless to improve a situation. In such tensed situation, females were promoted just to make responsible of such failures because there would be rare chances of a female to handle situation wisely. Researchers discussed the two approaches in research that focus the gender discrimination in leadership. The first approach point out that women have a lack of opportunity to move to the upper level as compare to men. The second approach point out that stereotype and discrimination against women are more accountable to creating the glass ceiling in front of women. Sticky floor also another barrier for women. An organization hired the Male and female on equal rank but female for bottom and male are hired for further hire scale. This gap effect at the wage distribution. Sticky floor also defined as horizontal inequality that means female are discriminated in recruitment, training and development and different assignments (Erik Ohls & Bihagen, 2006).

There are many reasons of glass ceiling. First is home sociology. Male prefer to male relaxation, social support and training and benefits and so on (Hartmann & Reskin, 1986). Second is sexiest attitudes (Ackler, 1990). It is assume as stereotype like male are more capable for decision making, leadership, power, authority than female (Rosefed, 1990). The other third is statistical discrimination. Due to family responsibility, working women are often absent from workplace than men (DE, 2005).

2.3. Women Career Advancement

The concept of women career advancement serves a vital presence in the field of management. Although it has some limitations and issues in its nature. Majority of women consider that their husbands do not share household as well as children’s responsibilities to make them feel relaxed. Due to the burden of these responsibilities, they become tired and stressed and their efficiency to cope with the problems of their career is affected (Schneeer & Reitman, 2002). On the other hand, married males having children and a home wife to look after him and his children all the time have the maximum attainments regarding salary increase. Anyhow, another most successful type is married men who have working wives. Married males with wife, all the time present in home to serve his family, have the paramount achievements comparatively to unmarried males. Partners provide their partners assistance and guidance regarding job in addition to home chores assigned to them. Managerial females due to lacking of their partner’s backing are not as successful.
In the perspective of Pakistan, this area has less explored from the point of view target variables. Gender gap area has been covered in many studies. Previous Gender Gap Index ranking of different south Asian countries are given as:

![Pakistan's Gender Gap Index](image)

Figure 1: Pakistan: Blue, Srilanka: Red, India: Green and Bangladesh: Purple

The summary of gender gap is illustrated above in figure. Our study aimed at investigating the relationship between gender stereotype, glass ceiling and women career advancement. This study will highlight the relationship between these variables by investigating two sectors of three cities e.g. Faisalabad, Lahore and Islamabad from Pakistan.

2.4. Research Model

![Research Model Diagram]

- **H1**: Gender stereotype has negative impact on women’s career advancement.
- **H2**: Gender stereotype has positive impact on glass ceiling.
- **H3**: Glass ceiling mediates the relationship among gender stereotype and women’s career advancement.

3. Method and Material

3.1. Sample and Procedure

The population for this study is considered three cities of Pakistan. The cities like Faisalabad, Lahore and Islamabad. The researcher took 2 sectors of taken cities, by considering these two sectors data was collected through questionnaire. Each city has covered these two sectors; telecommunication and banking. The sample size was consisted of 340. The sampling was done through convenience sampling technique. The acquired sample size is 272. Questionnaire consisted on three scales related to variables of study has adopted. Five point Likert type scale has been used to measure the responses from strongly disagree to strongly disagree.
3.2. Measures

3.2.1. Gender Stereotype

The Gender stereotype measured by WAMS instrument that consist on the 5-point Likert scale from 1-strongly disagree to 5-strongly agree. It consist of 20 items scale that is developed by (Peters, 1974). WAMS stands for Turkish version of the (WAMS) Women as Managers Scale. 10 items related to gender stereotype and the other 5-items are relevant to women career advancement. The Cronbach’s alpha of this scale was 0.8.

3.2.2. Glass Ceiling

To measure the glass ceiling 11-items scale was used which is developed by SANEF (South African National Editors Forum) survey report in 2007. The scale was modified according to the needs of the research. The questionnaire format followed the 5-point Likert scale to collect the responses of respondents from strongly agree to strongly disagree.

3.2.3. Women’s Career Advancement

WAMS instrument covers the items of attitude towards women career advancement. The Turkish version of WAMS is consisted on 20-items which is developed by (Peters, 1974), 10 items related to gender stereotype and the other 5-items are relevant to women career advancement. The 5-point Likert type format is followed and the Cronbach’s alpha was 0.8.

3.3. Analysis Procedure

Analysis of data consists of two parts. Part -1 shows demographic data. In addition, part -2 shows the analysis of the glass ceiling effect in service sectors of Pakistan. The Cronbach alpha of variables, which show the reliability of variables. The first variable has 0.808 Cronbach alphas. The second variable has 0.788 and a third variable has 0.722. Means and Std. deviation of all variables also involved in this research. The gender stereotype has maximum mean value 3.33 and std. deviation is 0.69. At second glass ceiling variable has 3.53 values with 0.63 std. deviation and women’s career advancement is at third position with the mean value of 2.80 with 1.02 std. deviation.

147 respondents were from the age group 1 (<30 years) 84 respondents were from age group 2 (30-40 years) 37 respondents were from age group 3 (41-49 years) while 3 respondents were from age group 4 (above 50 years). There are 6 employees having an intermediate level qualification. 116 respondents were with bachelor’s degrees and 150 respondents secured postgraduate level degrees in their respective fields of discipline. 83 respondents having less than three years’ experience. 75 respondents having (3-5years) experience, 74 respondents having (6-10 years) experience, and 40 respondents having above 10 years’ experience. 111 respondents from the banking sector and 161 respondents from telecom sector.

4. Results

4.1 Correlations Matrix
The table shows the correlation matrix. The correlation matrix shows bivariate correlation coefficients among variable pairs. To evaluate the inter-correlation, Pearson correlation analysis is performed. The table shows the inter-correlation figures about all the variables, Demographic Variable, gender stereotype, glass ceiling, women’s career advancement and masculine culture.

When the correlations were performed demographic variables with gender stereotype and glass ceiling, there is no significant correlation (age, qualification, tenure and sectors). When the correlations were performed between demographic variables and women’s career advancement; there is no significant correlation between women career advancement and age. There is a significant but weak positive relationship between women career advancement and qualification (r = .154*, p<.05). There is no significant correlation between women career advancement and tenure, and no significant correlation between women career advancement and sectors.

When the correlations were performed between glass ceiling and gender stereotype; there is a significant but strong positive relationship between glass ceiling and gender stereotype (r =.538, p<.1). When the correlation was performed between women career advancement and gender stereotype; there is a significant but strong negative relationship women career advancement and gender stereotype (r = -217**, p<.1). When the correlation was performed between women career advancement and glass ceiling, there is a significant but strong negative relationship between women career advancement and glass ceiling (r = -.004**, p<.01).

### 4.2 Regression Analysis

**Table 2: Hierarchical Regression Result Testing Mediator**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Women’s career advancement</th>
<th>Beta</th>
<th>R</th>
<th>R²</th>
<th>F</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Step 1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender stereotype</td>
<td>-0.321**</td>
<td>0.537</td>
<td>0.288</td>
<td>108.939**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Step 2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender stereotype</td>
<td>0.041</td>
<td>0.441</td>
<td>0.194</td>
<td>32.306**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glass ceiling</td>
<td>-0.728**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*P < .05 **P < .01
For the mediation effect (Hypothesis 3), we followed Preacher, Rucker, and Hayes’s (2007) suggestion and tested. Hypothesis 3 predicted the mediation effect of glass ceiling in the relationship between gender stereotype and women’s career advancement. As explained earlier, we followed Baron and Kenny (1986) procedures to test Hypothesis 3. In this table step 1 indicated a significant negative relationship between gender stereotype (b= 0.321, \( p < 0.05 \)) and women’s career advancement. Lastly, a hierarchical regression strategy (Baron & Kenny, 1986) shown in this table indicating that the gender stereotype was entered at the first step, glass ceiling was entered in the second step. Glass ceiling has negative relationship with career advancement (b=-0.321). Gender stereotype has negative relationship with career advancement (b=-.321, p<.01) when the glass ceiling is entered into the equation, then negative relationships of gender stereotype is insignificantly strengthened with woman career advancement (\( \beta = 0.041, P < .01 \)) indicating full mediation between gender stereotype and women’s career advancement. (\( \beta = -0.728, p< .01 \)).

Table 3: Analyses of Simple Effect

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dependent Variable</th>
<th>Mediator</th>
<th>Independent</th>
<th>PMX</th>
<th>PYM</th>
<th>Direct effects (PYX)</th>
<th>Indirect effects (PYM *PMX)</th>
<th>Total effects (PYX + P YM PMX)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Women’s career advancement</td>
<td>Glass ceiling</td>
<td>Gender stereotype</td>
<td>0.498** (.047)</td>
<td>-0.728** (.104)</td>
<td>0.041 (.096)</td>
<td>-0.361 (.066)</td>
<td>-0.321** (.088)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: PMX refers to paths from Gender Stereotype to the mediators (i.e., Glass ceiling), PYM refers to paths from the mediator to the outcome variable (i.e., Women’s career advancement).

Table shows the path of relationships in terms of the direct, indirect, and total effects of gender stereotype on women’s career advancement at different levels of psychological detachment. Thus, PMX (0.498, p<0.05) refers to the paths from X (gender stereotype) to M (glass ceiling mediator); PYM (-0.728, p>0.05) is the path from M (glass ceiling) to Y (women’s career advancement); PYX (0.041) is the path from X to Y (that is, the direct effect of gender stereotype on women’s career advancement); PYM*PMX (-0.361, p>0.05) refers to the indirect effects, and PYX+ (PYM * PMX ) (-0.321, p>0.01) is the total effect of X on Y.

5. Discussion

Women have to face obstacles in her career due to stereotype perception about in different fields. The study describes about the glass ceiling effect in service sector of Pakistan. Pakistan has 135th position in world economic gender gap index 2013 ranking. Gender stereotype has negative impact on women’s career advancement. It absolutely was expected that gender stereotype diminishes the women’s career advancement. The hypothesis seemed to be analyzed through correlation and regression. The outcomes associated with the correlation were (\( r = -217** , p<.1 \)). In regression analysis the result demonstrated that there was a significant but negative relationship between gender stereotype (b= 0.321, p < 0.05) and women’s career advancement. Therefore, it verified that the stereotype perception of employees regarding females decreases her career advancement.

Gender stereotype has positive impact on glass ceiling. We forecasted that females tend to be more discriminated as compare to males in service sector. The glass ceiling effect seemed to be computed through statistical analysis correlation and regression. The result showed that there is a significant relationship (\( r = .538, p<.1 \)) between gender stereotype and glass ceiling.

Glass ceiling mediates the relationship among gender stereotype and women’s career advancement. The outcomes associated with the correlation were (\( r = -.004** , p<.01 \)). A hierarchical regression strategy (Baron & Kenny, 1986) shown that gender stereotype has negative relationship with career advancement (b=-.321, p<.01) when the glass ceiling is entered into the equation, then negative relationships of gender stereotype is insignificantly...
strengthened with woman career advancement (β = 0.041, P < .01) demonstrating the full mediation between gender stereotype and women’s career advancement. (β = -0.728, p< .01).

The past research also determines that the males also have perception that they feel comfortable if they work with male counterparts (Kanter, 1977). Most of the female consciously move to downwards in their professional career due to stereotype perception.

The past researcher used to say in their findings that sometimes females are avoid to get promotional chances due to dual responsibilities as work and family life. Those are hurdles in female career advancement because they perceived less cooperation from their spouses. This creates psychological stress and has to leave opportunity. According to Morrison and Ryan (1987) females are observed under more critical standards as compare to male, such type of behavior of management disappoint the females. This might be due to the traditional administration gender role like “think manager-think male”. On the base of current and previous research, our third hypothesis is confirmed.

The outcome of this study offers consideration that the organizations must make the policies to resolve glass ceiling issues and fair recruitment of talented females. Organizations must take step seriously against female harassment, which will be helpful for female’s career advancement. Organizations must resolve the gender inequality perception by treating males and females equally. Organizations must provide opportunities to females to move to the upper level for their professional growth. Organizations must provide the benefits on the bases of equality (as females who have educations, experiences, capabilities equal to males). Glass ceiling regarding the female’s social ban in particular fields i.e. construction etc. must also be broken. Females must be evaluated fairly for their job performance.

Firstly, the research is conducting in service sectors of Pakistan; future research can evaluate the gender inequality in construction and manufacturing sectors. The actual sample was quite small gathered from banking and telecom sector, may not be generalized to whole population Only females group are focused in present research. The researcher is focusing only one sector of Pakistan i.e. service sector. The other segments i.e. Construction sector, manufacturing sectors etc. can be covered in future researches. Countless variables effect glass ceiling. It is not probable to incorporate all of them in a single study. A comparative study of glass ceiling in between service and other sectors of Pakistan can be designed on vast level.

Glass ceiling has been studied in different fields, Psychology, sociology, economics and management. This study was conducted to fill the gap in the women career advancement by glass ceiling issues. This study specially captured the area of glass ceiling of females in service sector of Pakistan. The present study concluded that stereotype have positive impacts on glass ceiling, and have negative impact on women career advancement. Because if an organization have male domain culture definitely they have stereotype perceptions about female, a man’s perception about female cannot take decision as male can do in a critical situation. Females are supposed to be less capable in critical situations and problems, due to these females are neglected in career advancement.

References


